

# Scaling Opportunity

*A Policy Playbook for Effective Statewide Career Pathways Programs*

By Brian Robinson, Paul Beach, Marisa Mission, Nick Lee, and Harold Hinds

SEPTEMBER 2023

# Executive Summary

State policymakers across the country often grapple with how best to align K-12 and higher education systems to address their state's workforce needs. Since the early 2010s, state policymakers have increasingly turned to career pathways programs as the answer.<sup>1</sup> Although this programming looks different in every state, career pathways typically include a sequence of courses and work-based learning experiences that allow high school students to obtain an industry-recognized credential or accelerate work toward a postsecondary degree.

Career pathways have enjoyed tremendous bipartisan support and proven publicly popular among a diverse coalition of stakeholders, but what specific factors lead to the successful adoption and sustainability of state career pathways programs?<sup>2</sup> Career pathways programs are inherently complex and require communication, collaboration, and coordination among thousands of individuals who are scattered across nearly all sectors of the economy. Successfully getting these programs off the ground is a feat; quickly scaling them to reach a critical mass of students and sustaining those efforts over nearly 10 years is almost unheard of — except in Delaware.

Launched in 2014, Delaware Pathways consists of state-approved career pathways programs that include both high school and advanced coursework, work-based learning experiences, and industry-recognized credentials that prepare students for middle- or high-skill careers, whether they enter the workforce immediately after high school or later in life. Delaware Pathways' programs of study were designed to be high quality and labor market-aligned in order to meet both economic demand and students' needs.

Delaware Pathways is recognized as an exemplar among career pathways programs.<sup>3</sup> The program's success is evident in the rapid and continued growth in participation in just under a decade, from less than 1% of all high school students in the 2014-15 school year to more than 50% of Delaware's high school students participating in the 2021-22 school year.<sup>4</sup> Nearly every district school and many charter schools in the state offer a pathway, and participation is largely representative of the demographic makeup of Delaware's public school student population.

In examining Delaware Pathways, seven "key moves" emerged as a playbook for the successful adoption and rapid scaling of a statewide pathways program. Although there remains room for improvement and growth for Delaware Pathways, these key moves can provide direction for state policymakers (e.g., state agency and legislative staff, gubernatorial administration officials) and advocates who are (a) in the process of creating, (b) in the early stages of implementing, or (c) looking to scale and sustain their state's career pathways program.

This playbook is not designed to be exhaustive or prescriptive. In our accompanying case study, [Scaling Opportunity: A Case Study on Delaware Pathways](#), we detail the evolution of Delaware Pathways, surface lessons learned, and offer policy recommendations. Allowing for the range of state contexts and the varied designs of career pathways programs across the country, this playbook identifies key moves that have been successful in Delaware and could be implemented in any state.

# Seven Key Moves to Create, Implement, Scale, and Sustain Career Pathways Programs

While each state is likely in a different place with respect to a statewide career pathways program, stakeholders at all levels will be able to execute on at least one, if not all, of the seven key moves in this playbook. Many of the resources leveraged in Delaware as well as the level of coordination that has taken place among state agencies, industry, and nonprofit organizations are not unique and can be replicated in any state. Each of the seven key moves described here demonstrates how states can develop and grow high-quality career pathways programs with intentionality, strategy, and ingenuity. These key moves draw on extensive desk research and interviews with nearly 20 stakeholders involved in creating or implementing Delaware Pathways.

1. Align on and Articulate a Vision
2. Build and Sustain Key Partnerships
3. Get Creative With Funding
4. Ensure That Programs Are High Quality and Easy to Implement
5. Commit to Data Collection to Assess Impact and Improve Practice
6. Create Accountability Around Equity
7. Communicate the Value of Pathways Programs to Employers

## Key Move 1

# Align on and Articulate a Vision

*Creating alignment on the vision, mission, and scope of career pathways programs — inside and outside state government — is key to achieving sustainability and scale.*

### Key Lesson

Policymakers and advocates must think strategically and at a high level across sectors, but also practically about how their state government operates. Most states can develop a broad vision for a career pathways program and set rough parameters for a governance structure. The harder part, however, is changing the way state government is organized and how it operates. Doing both simultaneously and efficiently is key for quickly adopting, implementing, and scaling these programs without losing momentum.

### Action Steps for State Policymakers and Advocates

- Assemble an initial advisory group that consists of leaders with sufficient technical knowledge and decision-making authority from K-12 education, higher education, the business community, state agencies, and the nonprofit sector.
- Draft an initial strategic plan that sets a broad vision and creates a governance structure for all key organizations inside and outside state government.
- Solicit input from the broader public on the strategic plan to expose weaknesses in program design and identify stakeholders who do not feel their voices are represented.
- Identify and empower a leader within the state government who has the authority, ability, and drive to convene bipartisan stakeholders and reorganize how the state operates.

## Key Move 1

### Delaware's Approach

Developing a shared vision for Delaware Pathways did not happen overnight. Instead, it resulted from stakeholders and high-level governmental officials convening regularly over several years. Two parallel processes unfolded in Delaware starting around 2014 — one publicly and the other inside of state government.

The first, much broader effort began when then-Gov. Jack Markell expressed interest in joining Jobs for the Future's (JFF) Pathways to Prosperity Network, a group of states dedicated to creating pathways programs. After Delaware joined the network, a working group was formed consisting of leaders from state agencies, major businesses, influential nonprofit organizations, higher education, and the K-12 system. The Steering Committee spearheaded the development of the Delaware Pathways Strategic Plan, which was released publicly in 2017 after extensive engagement with the public.<sup>5</sup> This document solidified an overarching vision for Delaware Pathways, identified high-level strategic priorities, and designated the organization(s) responsible for each priority.

Around the same time, Delaware received a \$2 million grant from JPMorgan Chase & Co. as part of its New Skills for Youth (NSFY) initiative to support the development of Delaware Pathways' strategic plan.<sup>6</sup> Delaware's NSFY team, led by the Delaware Department of Education's (DDOE's) Career and Technical Education (CTE) office, conducted a needs assessment of Delaware's career preparation system and analyzed student outcome data. They learned that better systems were needed to prepare all students to participate in the state's workforce.<sup>7</sup> This process informed the strategic plan, building on Delaware's career readiness system and reorganizing and reprioritizing efforts within the DDOE. The strategic plan also became the catalyst for rewriting the state's Strengthening Career and Technical Education for the 21st Century Act (Perkins V) plan and aligning it to the state's school accountability system, as well as numerous other changes.

## Key Move 2

# Build and Sustain Key Partnerships

*State policymakers and advocates must identify which agencies, nongovernmental organizations, and individuals they should partner with to ensure the effective implementation of career pathways programs.*

### Key Lesson

States should identify strong, reliable partners with a track record of supporting career-readiness initiatives, the ability to convene stakeholders, and an established network of funders. States must be flexible and adaptable, and be able to pivot and bring on additional partners as needed to make the programs work.

### Action Steps for State Policymakers and Advocates

- Identify and empower nonprofit intermediaries that have strong relationships across the state and deep networks to lead and manage regular convenings.
- Task nonprofit intermediaries with securing private funding on an ongoing basis.
- Establish a statewide workforce intermediary along with a network of local and regional intermediaries that can facilitate connections among K-12, higher education, and the business community.

## Key Move 2

### Delaware's Approach

Nonprofit organizations like Rodel and the United Way of Delaware were key early partners in helping create and implement Delaware Pathways. The Delaware Department of Labor (DDOL) and local business leaders were also helpful in convincing the private sector to support these initiatives.

Rodel and the United Way of Delaware secured more than \$3 million in private grants during the first phase of implementation.<sup>8</sup> Rodel went on to raise more than \$17 million in private grants and government funds during the past seven years.<sup>9</sup> Beyond financial support, Rodel regularly convened stakeholders, including setting agendas and managing meetings. This role was essential to keep lines of communication open, identify implementation challenges, and create space for relationships to grow and strengthen. Perhaps the most vital role Rodel and the United Way of Delaware played was as a thought leader and critical friend. One partner, Shana Payne, director of education at JFF, said: "We really engaged Rodel as a thought partner that could bring people to the table because of their relationships across sectors. As a neutral player, Rodel had flexibility in how they presented ideas and pushed critical conversations that we could not as a government entity."<sup>10</sup>

The leaders of Delaware Pathways realized early on that employers would need a lot of support to effectively partner with schools to offer work-based learning experiences to high school students. Based on this realization, Delaware created the Office of Work-Based Learning (OWBL). The decision to house OWBL at the state's only community college system, Delaware Technical Community College (Delaware Tech), was strategic; not only did the college have campuses throughout the state, but it also maintained deep relationships with employers and engaged regularly with K-12 schools and four-year institutions. As implementation progressed, however, it became clear that supporting individual employers at scale was not possible for OWBL to do alone. In response, OWBL is now partnering with local intermediaries, such as Code Differently, Strive, and Junior Achievement, that are better positioned to partner with local employers.

## Key Move 3

# Get Creative With Funding

*Ensuring adequate funding through state education departments, local school districts, private partnerships, federal grants, or some combination thereof is critical for implementing, sustaining, and scaling career pathways programs.*

### Key Lesson

States should be prepared to pull funding from wherever they can, including leveraging federal funding from Perkins and Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) to implement and sustain their program — a viable option available to any state. Additionally, it's important right from the beginning to bring in philanthropic partners with an openness to innovation. The policymakers and practitioners on the ground then need to deliver high-quality programs to sustain those investments. Stakeholders credit these efforts with the acquisition of Delaware Pathways 2.0 funding.

### Action Steps for State Policymakers and Advocates

- Align state plans for federal grant programs to braid funding streams, consolidate administrative processes, and create shared accountability mechanisms.
- Codify career pathways programs in the state budget to secure long-term, sustained funding support.
- Cultivate other funding sources (e.g., private grants, philanthropic giving).



## Key Move 3

### Delaware's Approach

When Delaware Pathways launched in 2014, there were no state-appropriated funds to support the program. Instead, DDOE's CTE office leveraged the state's Perkins reserve funding along with federal WIOA and Race to the Top dollars to provide grants to local school districts and charter schools for expanding pathways programs and to support capacity building, administrative operations, and teacher professional development.<sup>11</sup> This, in addition to funding from Delaware's Departments of Labor, Health and Social Services, and Office of Higher Education, supported the initial implementation of Delaware Pathways.<sup>12</sup>

One perceived limitation of Delaware Pathways is its lack of a dedicated funding source. Several interviewees indicated uncertainty about the long-term sustainability of Delaware Pathways, absent a stable source of federal and/or philanthropic funds.

However, Delaware has made the funding work, largely relying on braided federal and philanthropic funding as budget deficits have limited its ability to make significant investments in Delaware Pathways programming.<sup>13</sup> Public and private stakeholders worked together to pursue funding efforts, which resulted in braided funding opportunities that have allowed the program to grow sustainably and offer districts and school leaders the flexibility to use funds as it best fits their needs.

Rodel and the United Way of Delaware are leading the coordination of financial support for Delaware Pathways, pursuing grants from corporations and philanthropic organizations, while the partnering state agencies apply for federal grants and request appropriations from the state legislature.<sup>14</sup> As one lead partner explained: "[Stakeholders] had a set of shared priorities that set them up to start braiding funding. When there was a grant opportunity, whether it was from the U.S. Department of Labor, philanthropy, or somewhere else, they went after it together in support of Delaware Pathways, regardless of who the fiscal agent was. They were able to leverage lots of different sources using that structure."<sup>15</sup>

The continued efforts of Delaware Pathways leaders to cultivate a diverse set of funding streams have enhanced the sustainability of the program and created an opportunity to expand into earlier grades. In 2021, Delaware announced a \$15.8 million investment in Delaware Pathways 2.0 to expand into middle schools, combining funding the state received from the American Rescue Plan Act with public and private contributions from Bloomberg Philanthropies, the Walton Family Foundation, American Student Assistance, the Delaware Business Roundtable Education Committee, and DDOE.<sup>16</sup>

## Key Move 4

# Ensure That Programs Are High Quality and Easy to Implement

*State policymakers and advocates must ensure that career pathways programs are high quality and that school districts have the resources and incentives to adopt them.*

## Key Lesson

States must partner with business and industry leaders and consult labor market information data to ensure that career pathways programs meet the needs of the local and state economy and lead to high-wage, in-demand jobs. Once programs are created, the state should incentivize districts to use them. Funding and ready-made programs were strong incentives for districts participating in Delaware Pathways.

## Action Steps for State Policymakers and Advocates

- Identify and design pathways to fill gaps in state career readiness programs.
- Align career pathways programs with local and state labor market needs and opportunities.
- Co-create career pathways programs with local employers and statewide industries.
- Establish clear and diversified incentives for districts to adopt state models.
- Identify exemplar districts, schools, or programs that have a track record of success, are high quality, and can be scaled statewide.

## Key Move 4

### Delaware's Approach

Several district leaders we spoke with noted that the key benefit of Delaware Pathways was that its programs are high quality and easy to administer.

The landscape prior to Delaware Pathways was described by one district administrator as the “wild, wild west,” in which each district or school developed its own local pathways programs.<sup>17</sup> Those programs varied in quality and alignment with one another, such that a student enrolled in one pathway at one school could have a completely different experience than a student enrolled in the same pathway at another school.

When Delaware Pathways was first created, DDOE and DDOL worked together and used labor market information to identify occupations by skill level and the level of education required. This list is published in Delaware's Occupation & Industry report, which is updated biannually — a reflection of the ever-fluctuating labor market.<sup>18</sup> DDOE and DDOL also created career clusters that became pathways. Delaware Tech and DDOE then worked with the respective industries to build the career pathways programs, including developing course content and professional learning models. They also developed classroom and equipment inventories for the new programs. Finally, Delaware Tech provided structures and supports for schools to integrate more meaningful work-based learning opportunities, including creating a curriculum to help schools better prepare students with the soft skills they would need in the workplace.

These new state model pathways brought a higher level of rigor and standardization to the program. Brian Mattix, an administrator with the Red Clay Consolidated School District, said: “[Delaware Pathways] filled in some of the gaps that the older models didn't have — for example, the opportunities at the end of our students' journey such as dual enrollment opportunities and certification opportunities. [The state] was offering really high-leverage and high-quality programs and pathways for us to follow.”<sup>19</sup>

After creating these model pathways, the state provided districts with access and offered incentives for adoption. One key incentive was that pathways were pre-designed and high quality, which made them easier and more appealing for districts to adopt. Other incentives included the curriculum and implementation resources that came along with the programs (e.g., a work-based learning infrastructure) and the grants (using Perkins reserve funds) the state offered districts for implementation. As former Delaware CTE Director Luke Rhine explained: “We [used our Perkins reserve funds to] create financial incentives to support the type of change that we wanted to see occur. We led with programmatic reform because it created opportunities to work with teachers and employers, and it directly connected to student outcomes. Programs are also things that people can talk about and have an opinion to help shape. It's not wonky. We then connected program growth to our financial strategy, which was a fairly easy lever to control, and it helped to remove many of the initial barriers to grow quickly.”<sup>20</sup>

## Key Move 5

# Commit to Data Collection to Assess Impact and Improve Practice

*Enabling data systems to capture sufficient information is pivotal to ensuring that programs adequately support students and industry partners.*

### Key Lesson

States looking to replicate elements of Delaware Pathways should make a deliberate effort to create a quality career readiness data ecosystem from the outset. This includes working with the relevant state agencies to create data-sharing agreements with robust privacy protections, securing funding from the legislature or other sources to develop sophisticated longitudinal data systems, and establishing the appropriate governance structures and expectations. States should also align accountability metrics specific to career pathways across federal plans (i.e., Perkins, WIOA, Every Student Succeeds Act) to enhance policy coherency, increase the efficiency of data collection efforts, and ensure stakeholders have access to consistent and transparent data on student participation and outcomes.

### Action Steps for State Policymakers and Advocates

- Begin with robust and uniform data collection, analysis, and usage policies and protocols in place.
- Create data-sharing agreements among the state's K-12, postsecondary, and labor agencies.
- Ensure there is a centralized system, process, and expectation to track disaggregated student enrollment and outcomes in career pathways programs.

## Key Move 5

### Delaware's Approach

**D**DOE tracks labor market data, including rates of employment, wages, and job and skill demand. School systems track participation, concentration, and completion data for students in Delaware Pathways and report those data to DDOE. The two agencies, DDOE and DDOL, have a data-sharing agreement to integrate student data into Delaware's Workforce Innovation and Opportunity System, "which will help connect students who have earned employment certificates to postsecondary and adult education opportunities."<sup>21</sup>

Despite having all these data, stakeholders we interviewed indicated that Delaware's data integration remains a work in progress as data systems for K-12 school districts, postsecondary institutions, and the workforce are not linked. Delaware is facing the same reality as many states across the country — collecting and comparing necessary information can be difficult. Only a few states, notably Maryland<sup>22</sup> and New Jersey,<sup>23</sup> have figured out how to develop a robust career readiness data ecosystem that includes an interconnected longitudinal data system, strong privacy laws and protections, sophisticated technology, and policies and processes that enable quality data collection, analysis, reporting, and use.<sup>24</sup>

However, the Delaware Workforce Development Board's three-year strategic plan for 2023-25 aims to make progress toward a more robust data ecosystem in Delaware. The strategic plan prioritizes building data systems to collect and distribute educational attainment and employment data, which includes the creation of a longitudinal data system that expands data-sharing agreements and links K-12 education to postsecondary and employment outcomes.<sup>25</sup>

As Delaware works to develop a connected longitudinal data system, there have been some ad hoc efforts to collect data from students about their postsecondary experiences. For example, RTI International is partnering with Rodel and DDOE on a study that surveys students who complete a sequence of career pathways courses in 2022 and 2023. Students will be surveyed six months after high school graduation on their education and employment activities and how those activities are connected to their high school career pathways programs. At the local level, some Delaware school districts have taken it upon themselves to collect data and track students once they graduate through phone calls and emails. These methods can provide a sample dataset but are not long-term solutions to the challenge of collecting comprehensive student outcome data.

Leaders in Delaware have taken other steps to collect, analyze, and use data from career pathways programs. During Rhine's tenure as Delaware's CTE director, DDOE began to improve its processes for tracking CTE pathway activity. In 2018, DDOE began linking course-level data with classification of instructional program codes across DDOE and district-level data systems.<sup>26</sup> This centralization of data allows DDOE to track student coursework and determine which students are participating, concentrating, or completing specific career pathways programs with greater precision. There are also data-sharing agreements in place with postsecondary institutions and with DDOL that enable DDOE to match data in its system to track postsecondary outcomes.

Although strides have been made in data collection efforts in Delaware, some local pathways program data remain decentralized, and matching CTE data with other statewide databases is challenging.<sup>27</sup>

## Key Move 6

# Create Accountability Around Equity

*Centering equity is critical to ensuring that historically underserved student populations, (e.g., Black, Hispanic, and low-income students) have full access to career pathways programs.*

### Key Lesson

States should regularly examine career pathways program data to identify equity gaps and have a plan in place to collaboratively address them at all levels of implementation. States should make data publicly available, including disaggregated data, so that policymakers, advocates, and the public can hold the state and institutions serving students accountable for all student outcomes.

### Action Steps for State Policymakers and Advocates

- Identify statewide equity gaps and barriers that impact equitable access to career pathways programs.
- Convene stakeholders, including teachers, parents, students, and administrators, to brainstorm solutions and develop action plans to identify and close equity gaps.
- Invest in training and resources to help school and district staff identify and mitigate any (un)conscious biases.
- Partner with advocates, including representatives from historically underserved student populations that have experience and credibility in the community, to co-create equity goals and ensure policy makes meaningful progress toward equity.
- Make career pathways data publicly available, including disaggregated data.

## Key Move 6

### Delaware's Approach

While administrators created Delaware Pathways with equity at the forefront, ensuring that all students have equal access to these programs has been challenging. DDOE collects and analyzes school-level, program-level, and state-level data on an annual basis.<sup>28</sup> Those data are disaggregated and compared to the state's student population to identify if equity gaps exist in terms of pathways participation and post-program outcomes. An analysis of 2020-21 school year data suggests fairly equitable enrollment in Delaware Pathways courses among student subpopulations; however, significant gaps exist between students who concentrate in or complete a pathways program.<sup>29</sup>

In the event there are inequities, DDOE and school districts work together to examine the root causes and generate a report that includes recommendations for closing any gaps.<sup>30</sup> Beyond this, state-, institutional-, and district-level leaders are all taking steps to address gaps that exist. For example, Delaware's CTE Director, Jon Wickert, reorganized his team so that one person is responsible for executing the office's equity strategy, which includes: (a) bringing a student voice to the table, (b) creating data routines, and (c) changing the technical assistance model to acknowledge data inequities with each district on a quarterly basis and provide supports as needed.<sup>31</sup> Each CTE staff member is responsible for managing a portion of the office's equity portfolio and identifying and addressing the needs of a specific special population.<sup>32</sup>

Some school and district administrators are also paying close attention to equity and taking active steps to ensure all their students have access to high-quality programs. In

one Delaware school district, staff are trained in strategies to recruit students into programs with equity in mind (e.g., being mindful of using inclusive language).<sup>33</sup> They also require students in ninth grade to try each of the different pathways offered at the school before committing to one. The aim is for students to avoid self-selecting themselves out of programs because of preconceived notions about what careers they could or should pursue based on their identity. The district also examines Delaware Pathways enrollment data to ensure students are not overrepresented or underrepresented in certain programs.

In another example, Delaware Tech has built relationships with community organizations that serve students from historically underserved communities. Through these relationships, Delaware Tech can proactively reach students where they are and share opportunities. As Dr. Paul Morris, associate vice president for Delaware Tech, said, "Working with our community partners allows the college to proactively reach students of need, meaning we can meet them where they are as opposed to having them seek us out for assistance."<sup>34</sup>

Despite these efforts, the value in data collection is the accountability that comes with making information publicly available. From this perspective, more can be done in Delaware. Delaware is not alone in this regard, as not many states have publicly available disaggregated CTE data. Tennessee<sup>35</sup> and Maryland<sup>36</sup> are among the few states with public career pathways program data dashboards. Future efforts should strive to make Delaware Pathways data widely available to researchers, advocates, and the public.

## *Key Move 7*

# Communicate the Value of Pathways Programs to Employers

*Policymakers and advocates building career pathways programs must convince business leaders of the value of supporting these programs for their bottom line.*

### **Key Lesson**

States must ensure that there is an early and sustained effort to involve business leaders in the creation and initial implementation of career pathways programs. States also must invest in resources to support and mediate industry involvement. Perhaps most important, policymakers must demonstrate, with evidence, that the time and resources employers expend in partnering with schools will be outweighed by the benefit they receive in the form of future employees and viable talent pipelines.

### **Action Steps for State Policymakers and Advocates**

- Identify industries and employers that would be strong partners, along with specific efforts employer partners can make to support career pathways programs.
- Create a value-add argument that communicates why supporting pathways programs is good for business.
- Establish formal structures (e.g., industry councils) to form partnerships, forge connections, and surface improvements needed for career pathways programs.



## Key Move 7

### Delaware's Approach

Industry partners were the first real champions of Delaware Pathways, cultivating interest in and providing seed money for the initial set of programs. However, as most career pathways programs involve hiring young people with limited work experience, some industry partners have been reluctant to support these programs and may not appreciate how beneficial they can be to meet workforce demand. To keep employers at the table and to strengthen relationships, policymakers must convince employers that pathways programs are not simply “nice to have” but a “must have.”

The Delaware Workforce Development Board engages directly with employers and regularly talks with them about the importance of Delaware Pathways so that they see the program as a strategy to build a talent pipeline. When Delaware received \$50 million in funds from the American Rescue Plan Act, the Delaware Workforce Development Board asked for funds to hire liaisons to help connect businesses with Delaware Pathways opportunities, including engaging with their local high school and providing work-based learning opportunities to students.<sup>37</sup>

Another approach has been the creation of industry councils by the Office of Work-Based Learning. These councils provide a venue for business leaders from across the state to work together to ensure career pathways programs in Delaware align with and are relevant to the work students will do in the workplace.<sup>38</sup> For example, the Tech Council of Delaware recently launched the Yes We Tech! summer internship program, a collaboration

among the Tech Council, Code Differently, Metropolitan Wilmington Urban League, and local employers in New Castle County. Students who complete the paid internship receive two certifications, one in digital literacy and another in soft skills.<sup>39</sup>

Keeping employers engaged in Delaware Pathways programming is critical. Employers are key to offering work-based learning opportunities for students, providing feedback through convenings and working groups that improve career pathways programs, helping education leaders select curriculum and instructional resources, and securing funding and other resources. However, policymakers and advocates fear that if employers do not feel they are getting anything out of the deal, then they may walk away from the program altogether. As Paul Herdman, president and CEO of Rodel, said: “Employer engagement is definitely an issue that a lot of states are wrestling with. My hope is that employers would look at this and say, ‘Hey, the cost-benefit makes sense.’ If employers only look at this as good corporate responsibility, and don’t see it as a human resource strategy that’s critical to the health of their industry and community, they’re eventually going to lose interest.”<sup>40</sup>

The importance of data to these efforts cannot be understated. Industry responds to actions that deliver a positive return on investment (ROI). High-quality data that allow Delaware Pathways to demonstrate that ROI and provide employers with evidence of effectiveness are critical to communicating the value of the program.

# Conclusion

Delaware's approach to a statewide career pathways model is notable for its longevity, scale, and consistency. Delaware Pathways is implemented in a consistent way in virtually every public school district and many charter schools in the state. This can be attributed to the state's careful use of public dollars, a framework that's easy to administer, and targeted support, which are key elements to its scale and sustainability.

While not prescriptive, this playbook uses the success of Delaware Pathways as a model and describes actions that other states, regardless of size, geography, or other factors, can apply in their own context. The seven key moves outlined in this playbook provide policymakers and advocates in states across the country with a road map to build high-quality pathways programs and expand opportunities for all students.

---

Read [Scaling Opportunity: A Case Study on Delaware Pathways](#) for more on the evolution of Delaware Pathways, lessons learned, and a set of policy recommendations.

# Endnotes

- 1 Jennifer Zinth, "Aligning K–12 and Postsecondary Career Pathways With Workforce Needs," Education Commission of the States, 2015, <https://www.ecs.org/wp-content/uploads/Aligning-K-12-and-postsecondary2.pdf>.
- 2 Linea Koehler, Harold Hinds, and Nick Lee, *Expanding Opportunity: How States Can Accelerate the Use of Career Pathways Programs to Help Young People Access Meaningful Careers*, Bellwether, March 2023, [https://bellwether.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/03/ExpandingOpportunity\\_Bellwether\\_March2023.pdf](https://bellwether.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/03/ExpandingOpportunity_Bellwether_March2023.pdf).
- 3 Robert Rothman, *Propelling College and Career Success: The Role of Strategic Partnerships in Scaling Delaware Pathways*, Jobs for the Future, 2020, [https://edscalellc.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/04/Delaware\\_Pathways\\_Case\\_Study.pdf](https://edscalellc.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/04/Delaware_Pathways_Case_Study.pdf).
- 4 Data Source: U.S. Department of Education National Center for Education Statistics Common Core of Data (CCD), "State Nonfiscal Public Elementary/Secondary Education Survey," 2016-17 v.1a, 2017-18 v.1a, 2018-19 v.1a, 2019-20 v.1a, 2020-21 v.1a, 2021-22 v.1a; "State Nonfiscal Public Elementary/Secondary Education Survey Membership Data," 2015-16 v.1a.; Rodel, *Delaware Public Education at a Glance*, 2019, 23; Rodel, *Delaware Public Education at a Glance*, 2021, 12; Rachel Pleet, "The Power of Partnership: Leading Students Down the Right Path," Rodel, <https://rodelde.org/author/rachel-pleet/>; Data provided to Rodel by the Delaware Department of Education and shared with Bellwether for analysis.
- 5 *Learning to Work: Delaware Pathways Strategic Plan*, Delaware Pathways, 2017, <https://delawarepathways.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/Delaware-Pathways-Strategic-Plan-March-2017-1.pdf>.
- 6 "Delaware Awarded \$2 Million to Improve Career Education," Delaware Department of Education, <https://www.doe.k12.de.us/site/Default.aspx?PageType=3&DomainID=4&PageID=1&ViewID=6446ee88-d30c-497e-9316-3f8874b3e108&FlexDataID=19310>; "New Skills for Youth Phase One Snapshot: Delaware," Advance CTE, 2017, [https://cte.careertech.org/sites/default/files/files/resources/Delaware\\_PhaseOne\\_Snapshot\\_2017.pdf](https://cte.careertech.org/sites/default/files/files/resources/Delaware_PhaseOne_Snapshot_2017.pdf).
- 7 "New Skills for Youth Phase One Snapshot: Delaware," Advance CTE, 2017, [https://cte.careertech.org/sites/default/files/files/resources/Delaware\\_PhaseOne\\_Snapshot\\_2017.pdf](https://cte.careertech.org/sites/default/files/files/resources/Delaware_PhaseOne_Snapshot_2017.pdf).
- 8 Rothman, *Propelling College and Career Success*.
- 9 P. Herdman, personal communication, June 26, 2023.
- 10 S. Payne, personal communication, July 11, 2023.
- 11 L. Rhine, personal communication, June 9, 2023; Larry Nagengast, "Delaware Pathways," R Street, 2020, <https://www.rstreet.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/Final-CSEW-4-Nagengast.pdf>; "Delaware WIOA State Plan for the Period 2020-2023," Delaware Workforce Development Board, 2020, [https://laborfiles.delaware.gov/main/wdb/wioa/plan/2020/finalcommentcopy02282020%20\(wjp\)%2010278.pdf](https://laborfiles.delaware.gov/main/wdb/wioa/plan/2020/finalcommentcopy02282020%20(wjp)%2010278.pdf).
- 12 Nagengast, "Delaware Pathways."
- 13 Rothman, *Propelling College and Career Success*.
- 14 Nagengast, "Delaware Pathways."
- 15 Lead partner, personal communication, June 27, 2023.
- 16 "Governor Carney, Lt. Governor Hall-Long Announce \$50M American Rescue Plan (ARPA) Investment in Jobs Training," Delaware official site, October 5, 2021, <https://news.delaware.gov/2021/10/05/governor-carney-lt-governor-hall-long-announce-50m-american-rescue-plan-arpa-investment-in-jobs-training/>.
- 17 B. Mattix, personal communication, June 13, 2023.
- 18 "Delaware Occupation and Industry Projections," Delaware Department of Labor, <https://labor.delaware.gov/divisions/oolmi/publications/delaware-occupation-and-industry-projections/>.
- 19 B. Mattix, personal communication, June 13, 2023.
- 20 L. Rhine, personal communication, June 9, 2023.
- 21 Rothman, *Propelling College and Career Success*.
- 22 "Case Study: Maryland – Longitudinal Data System Center," Advance CTE, 2021, [https://dataquality.careertech.org/sites/default/files/case-studies/DataQualityCaseStudy2\\_Maryland\\_2021.pdf](https://dataquality.careertech.org/sites/default/files/case-studies/DataQualityCaseStudy2_Maryland_2021.pdf).
- 23 "Case Study: New Jersey – Education to Earnings Data System," Advance CTE, 2021, [https://dataquality.careertech.org/sites/default/files/case-studies/DataQualityCaseStudy3\\_NewJersey\\_2021.pdf](https://dataquality.careertech.org/sites/default/files/case-studies/DataQualityCaseStudy3_NewJersey_2021.pdf).
- 24 "Career Readiness Data Quality and Use: Policy Benchmark Tool," Advance CTE, <https://dataquality.careertech.org/>.
- 25 *3 Year Strategic Plan: 2023–2025*, Delaware Workforce Development Board, 2023, [https://laborfiles.delaware.gov/main/wdb/Delaware\\_Workforce\\_Development\\_Board\\_Strategic\\_Plan.pdf](https://laborfiles.delaware.gov/main/wdb/Delaware_Workforce_Development_Board_Strategic_Plan.pdf).
- 26 A. Phillips, personal communication, June 6, 2023.
- 27 Ibid.
- 28 "Making Good on the Promise: Examining Access and Achievement Gaps," Advance CTE, 2018, [https://cte.careertech.org/sites/default/files/files/resources/Making\\_Good\\_Promise\\_Examining\\_Gaps\\_Sept2018.pdf](https://cte.careertech.org/sites/default/files/files/resources/Making_Good_Promise_Examining_Gaps_Sept2018.pdf).
- 29 Data provided to Rodel by the Delaware Department of Education and shared with Bellwether for analysis.
- 30 "Making Good on the Promise: Examining Access and Achievement Gaps," Advance CTE.
- 31 J. Wickert, personal communication, June 16, 2023.
- 32 "Engaging Representatives of Learners With Special Population Status through Perkins V," Advance CTE, April 2021, [https://cte.careertech.org/sites/default/files/files/resources/Engaging\\_Special\\_Populations\\_April\\_2021.pdf](https://cte.careertech.org/sites/default/files/files/resources/Engaging_Special_Populations_April_2021.pdf).
- 33 A. Hodges, personal communication, June 15, 2023.
- 34 P. Morris, personal communication, June 27, 2023.
- 35 CTE Dashboard, Tennessee Comptroller of the Treasury, <https://app.powerbigov.us/view?r=eyJrjoiMjQyZGNjOTgtOWE1OS00MDM1LTg2OWYtNmE5OWM0NGJyZ2ZliwidCl6ljVIMWJiMmQ4LTBmMGUtNDkwNS1hY2M5LTczNT-FmODUwNmZmNiJ9>.
- 36 "Maryland CTE Data," CTE Maryland, <https://www.mdctedata.org/>.
- 37 J. Barnekov-Staib, personal communication, June 29, 2023.
- 38 "Industry Councils," Delaware Office of Work-Based Learning, <https://deowbl.org/industry-councils/>.
- 39 Holly Quinn, "How Yes, We Tech! Internships Prepped These Delaware High Schoolers for Future Careers," *Technical.ly*, August 4, 2023, <https://technical.ly/professional-development/yes-we-tech-delaware-high-schoolers-internships/>.
- 40 P. Herdman, personal communication, June 26, 2023.

## About the Authors



### BRIAN ROBINSON

Brian Robinson is a senior analyst at Bellwether in the Policy and Evaluation practice area. He can be reached at [brian.robinson@bellwether.org](mailto:brian.robinson@bellwether.org).



### PAUL BEACH

Paul Beach is an associate partner at Bellwether in the Policy and Evaluation practice area. He can be reached at [paul.beach@bellwether.org](mailto:paul.beach@bellwether.org).



### MARISA MISSION

Marisa Mission is a policy analyst at Bellwether in the Policy and Evaluation practice area. She can be reached at [marisa.mission@bellwether.org](mailto:marisa.mission@bellwether.org).



### NICK LEE

Nick Lee is a partner at Bellwether in the Policy and Evaluation practice area. He can be reached at [nick.lee@bellwether.org](mailto:nick.lee@bellwether.org).



### HAROLD HINDS

Harold Hinds is an associate partner at Bellwether in the Policy and Evaluation practice area.

## About Bellwether

Bellwether is a national nonprofit that exists to transform education to ensure systemically marginalized young people achieve outcomes that lead to fulfilling lives and flourishing communities. Founded in 2010, we work hand in hand with education leaders and organizations to accelerate their impact, inform and influence policy and program design, and share what we learn along the way. For more, visit [bellwether.org](http://bellwether.org).

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We would like to thank the many individuals who gave their time and shared their knowledge with us to inform our work, including Rodel, for its financial support of this project. We want to thank Joanna Barnekov-Staib, Mark Baxter, Madeleine Bayard, Fay Blake, Charlotte Cahill, Dan Cruce, Paul Herdman, Amelia Hodges, Brian Mattix, Paul Morris, Shana Payne, Luke Rhine, Kenneth Shores, Sandra Staklis, Lisa Stoner-Torbert, Rachel Gold Turney, Wenona Sutton, Rex Varner, and Jonathan Wickert for being generous with their time and participating in interviews.

We would also like to thank our Bellwether colleagues Thomas Gold and Kaitlin Beeson for their support. Thank you to Alyssa Schwenk, Kate Neifeld, Andy Jacob, Zoe Campbell, Julie Nguyen, and Amber Walker for shepherding and disseminating this work, and to Super Copy Editors.

The contributions of these individuals and entities significantly enhanced our work; however, any errors in fact or analysis remain the responsibility of the authors.



© 2023 Bellwether

- © This report carries a Creative Commons license, which permits noncommercial re-use of content when proper attribution is provided. This means you are free to copy, display and distribute this work, or include content from this report in derivative works, under the following conditions:
- ① **Attribution.** You must clearly attribute the work to Bellwether and provide a link back to the publication at [www.bellwether.org](http://www.bellwether.org).
- ② **Noncommercial.** You may not use this work for commercial purposes without explicit prior permission from Bellwether.
- ③ **Share Alike.** If you alter, transform, or build upon this work, you may distribute the resulting work only under a license identical to this one.

For the full legal code of this Creative Commons license, please visit [www.creativecommons.org](http://www.creativecommons.org). If you have any questions about citing or reusing Bellwether content, please contact us.